



Political Science & International Relations

Crash Course & Test Series - 2021

Test 05

Time Allowed: 3 Hours

Max Marks: 250

Name BHARVESHYA
Test Date -
Email Address -
UPSC Roll No -

Instructions:

1. There are EIGHT questions divided in TWO SECTIONS and candidate has to attempt five questions in all.
2. Question Nos. 1 and 5 are compulsory and out of the remaining, any three are to be attempted choosing at least ONE question from each section.
3. Content of the answer is more important than its length.
4. Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of the booklet in the space provided.
5. Content of the answer is more important than its length.
6. Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
7. All parts of the question should be written at one place itself.
8. Write the test in exam atmosphere.
9. **Filling all the details in BLOCK LETTERS is mandatory.**

S. No.	a	b	c	d	e	Total
1						
2				X	X	
3				X	X	
4				X	X	
5						
6				X	X	
7				X	X	
8				X	X	
Grand Total						

	Poor	Average	Good	Very Good	Excellent
--	------	---------	------	-----------	-----------



SHUBHIRA RANJAN

Always Ahead

25, Pusa Road, Karol Bagh, Delhi 110005. ☎ 011 45612719

Understanding of Questions					
Structure & Flow					
(a) Introduction					
(b) Conclusion					
(c) Overall					
Subject Knowledge					
Presentation					
(a) Underline					
(b) Paragraph					
(c) Overall					

Overall Remarks:

Dear Student,

All the best for next test...!!!

(Please do not write anything except the question number in this space)

कृपया इस स्थान में प्रश्न संख्या के अतिरिक्त कुछ न लिखें।

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
Content of the Question is more important than length.

(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को इस हार्शिए में नहीं लिखना चाहिए
Candidates must not write on this margin

1(a) Philosophical approach uses means of analytical reasoning, critique, and creating 'conceptual categories' to study the nature of Politics.

It is traditionally dominant mode starting from ancient greeks.

It is Normative in nature that is concerned with OUAHT over IS. For eg:

Socrates using Dialectical Reasoning was first to ask questions like 'what is a good life? Justice? Courage?'

In contrast with Empirical or Historical methods that

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
Content of the Question is more important than length.

(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

are descriptive; Philosophical approach is prescriptive. As Plato in THE REPUBLIC prescribes 'Philosopher King' as means to create Utopian Ideal State.

Further it is radical and change-oriented as Marx recommends 'Proletarian Revolution' to undo material Injustices.

However post World War II it was criticized as 'armchair theorizing' (Easton), 'an escape mechanism' (John Elammanetz) and unscientific (Chicago School Behaviourists).

Yet we owe our present political notions of Justice, Rights, Equality etc to Philosophical Approach. Hence Philosophical Questioning and empirics for answering for study of politics.





Que.1(b)

Highlight the difference between Sex and Gender. (10 Marks)

Radical Feminists or the second-generation of feminism starting in 1960s went beyond Civil and Political Rights to question the Patriarchal structure of society.

Inspired by the New Social Movements (Marcuse), counter-culture movements and the Sexual Revolution in West they proposed a fluid-notion of gender.

Existential Feminists Simone de Beauvoir differentiated between SEX and GENDER.

She argued Sex is Biological while Gender is a Socio-cultural construct.



In THE SECOND SEX, she said 'One is not born woman but becomes woman'. That is Patriarchal Basic Structure of society through socialization creates specific gender-roles. (eg: Motherhood, Housewife)

Further Post-modern Feminists like Judith Butler 'deconstructed' gender to a performative, socio-linguistic category.

The LGBTQ+ Movements of present are using this difference b/w sex and gender to gain legitimacy and Social Acceptance for multitude of gender-identities disconnected from sex.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

Que.1(c)

Enumerate the salient features of Buddhist political thought. (10 Marks)

Sociologists Gail Omvedt has identified Buddha not just as religio-spiritual leader but as a Political Philosopher.

Hence Buddhist Political Thought with focus on good and Ethical Governance/Statecraft.

Its salient features

include :

- ① Origin of State from corruption of men from material desires with State as enforcer of Dhamma.
- ② Republican tradition with King elected from Mahasammata (council).
- ③ Buddhist King resembles Plato's Philosopher King who is 'noblest'

of all', embodies wisdom, is source of knowledge and is gentle, modest, self-less and Morally Upright.
(eg: Ashoka)

④ Domestic affairs are guided by common humanity and religious toleration.

⑤ Foreign Policy is of Idealism (peace and non-violence) and 'Dhamma gosha' over 'Bengsha' (victory by Dhamma not war).

Thus Modern Political Products like Secularism, Republicanism, Foreign policy of PANCHASHEEL were present in their nebulous form in Buddhist Political Thought.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.1(d)

Overlapping Consensus .Comment. (10 Marks)

Communitarian scholars like Michael Walzer, Charles Taylor rejected Rawlsian notion of Universal Justice as western imposition bound to conflict with traditional identity/values.

As a response John Rawls in POLITICAL LIBERALISM described the Political Conception of Justice as 'Overlapping Consensus'.

He argued for a 'Public Sphere' based on 'Public Reasoning' and 'free inquiry'.

In that Public Sphere; debate should go beyond 'Metaphysical' elements of ethics/religion. Rather focus on developing an 'Overlapping consensus' based on Principles

of Reciprocity, Toleration and common humanity.

He argues, similar to Isaiah Berlin, Toleration forms the core heart of Liberalism.

It is the key for mutual respect and co-existence between diverse societies like India, USA.

With increasing 'Religious Polarization' (eg: Burqa ban in FRANCE) and declining 'Public Sphere'; Rawlsian idea of 'Overlapping consensus' can overcome socio-political differences to derive a common political agenda.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.1(e)

Critically examine the concept of Asian Values. (10 Marks)

The concept of 'Asian Values' proposed by Lee Kuan Yew (Singapore) is a retort to Western Liberal Discourse of Universal Human Rights (HRS).

He argues HRS are a western imposition on Asian societies that are less individualistic and more collectivistic.

Asian Values describes the priority of Asian countries is not necessarily Individual Freedoms and Liberal Democracy but economic growth, peace and stability.

Communitarians welcome this notion of ^{asian} values embedded in 'Social Reality'.

But liberals rejects it



as an excuse for 'Authoritarianism' of Asian leaders including Mr. Lee (Former PM SNG).

Amartya Sen contends that Asia is not a Homogenous entity. Within Asia there are multiple and often paradoxical values and beliefs.

For instance Japan, South Korea and India have accepted Democracy and HRs Discourse.

Thus idea of 'Asian Values' is an eastern discourse to counter western and promote collective duties over individual rights.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks:	

(Please do not write anything except the question number in this space)
कृपया इस स्थान में प्रश्न संख्या के अतिरिक्त कुछ न लिखें।

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
Content of the Question is more important than length.
(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को इस हाशिए में नहीं लिखना चाहिए
Candidates must not write on this margin

2(a) 'Political Science begins and ends with State'
- Garner

The concept of State forms the basic distinction between different Political Ideologies.

Classical Liberals like John Locke prefer a minimal nightwatchman state that maintains Right to 'Life, Liberty and Property'.

They see state in a 'Protective' role as non-coercive preserver of 'Negative Liberty'.

However Modern or Social Liberals like John



SHUBHRA RANJAN

Always Ahead

25, Pusa Road, Karol Bagh, Delhi 110005. ☎ 011 45612719

Rawls argue for a Welfare state that is poor-poor and provides a social safety net.

They believe in developmental role of state to create an egalitarian society and uphold Social Justice.

Amongst Welfarists; Ronald Dworkin suggest 'Just Initial Distribution'; Rawls prefer 'Affirmative Action' for marginalized while Amartya Sen focusses on 'Capability Building'.

Thus 'minimal state' opposes 'state intervention' while 'welfare state' welcomes 'state Intervention'.

Neoliberalism is modern avatar of 'minimal state' of classical liberalism.

It promotes 'roll back of state', liberalization of trade and privatization of economy.

As Milton Friedman argued solution to even socio-political problems lies in the market. [Market-Fundamentalism].

Starting with Thatcherism (UK) and Reaganism (USA) it gained global acceptance with creation of Liberal International Economic Order (LIEO) as both Socialist India and Communist China accepted Washington Consensus. (1990s)
However post global financial

Crisis (2008-09), unpeaceful rise of China' and the recent COVID shock the future of Neo-liberal state looks pessimistic.

As Thomas Piketty claims 'Global Capitalist Order' is facing an existential crisis. States have 'rolled back in' with renegeance, Welfare State with spending on Health and education is crucial and as slogans like 'America First' and 'Atmanirbhar Bharat' show signs of greater 'Self-reliance' and 'De-globalisation'. Thus the need to move beyond Neoliberalism to Sustainable & Inclusive Capitalism.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

(Please do not write anything except the question number in this space)

कृपया इस स्थान में प्रश्न संख्या के अतिरिक्त कुछ न लिखें।

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
Content of the Question is more important than length.
(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को इस हार्शिए में नहीं लिखना चाहिए
Candidates must not write on this margin

2(b) Plato in THE REPUBLIC attempts to describe an 'Ideal State' ruled by Guardian Class (Rulers and Soldiers) who are men of highest caliber (Men of Reason and Courage)

Yet Plato recognizes that union of political power and 'economic temptation' is a desperate evil. It will lead to 'Corruption' ^{even} of Men of reason and his 'Meritocracy' will deteriorate into 'Plutocracy'

Thus he proposes a heroic and radical remedy in form of Communism of Property and Family.

(Please do not write anything except the question number in this space)

कृपया इस स्थान में प्रश्न संख्या के अतिरिक्त कुछ न लिखें।

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
Content of the Question is more important than length.
(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को इस हाशिए में नहीं लिखना चाहिए
Candidates must not write on this margin

He argues abolition of 'Private Property' will reduce the possibility of corruption amongst Guardian class.

But that is not enough as root-cause of corruption is 'Familial Interest' or 'Nepotism'.

Thus 'Communism of 'Family' will make state decide who shall marry whom and the kids shall be brought up by state. This leaves no scope for Discrimination and Personal Interest as 'Whole State is the Family'.

However Aristotle his greatest critic~~s~~ proclaimed that Plato's diagnosis is



correct but remedy is wrong.

Though property is source of corruption but it is also a source of Motivation, inspiration and gives sense of achievement. Trusteeship and Charity is a better solution.

while Family is source of meaning and is a time-tested institution and Communism of wives is akin to Barbarianism.

Though well-intentioned as Karl Popper argues it lays the groundwork for modern Totalitarian Regimes [USSR, Nazi-Germany, China], justify Eugenics and is enemy of 'Open Society' for quilt of Essentialism, Holism & Historicism.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.2(c)

Critically examine the possible implications of Gandhi's views on the relationship between religion and politics. (15 Marks)

As Prof. Humayun Kabir describes Gandhi was a great synthesizer of religion (Gita, Bible) and practical politics ('My Experiments with Truth').

Inspired from ancient Greeks like Socrates and Plato he imbued politics with normative ethics.

He also derived his ethics from religion. Thus for Gandhi Religion and Politics were continuous and overlapping disciplines.

For him 'Politics without religion' is a deadly sin. If politics is drained of religious/moral content it becomes pure 'power-play' and is akin to 'Prostitution'.



He asserted that twin evils of Imperialism (British) and Fascism (Italy & Germany) are product of Machiavellianism that separates religion from politics.

Further Modern/Western Secularism that considers religion and politics as autonomous is responsible for decline in Public Morality and Communalization (eg: Burqa Ban in FRANCE).

Rather religion should guide politics and politics should bring Tolerance (SARVA Dharma Sambhava) to politics.

Following his Political guru Gokhale, he calls for Spiritualization of Politics as cure for modern

evils.

However Modernizers like Pt. Nehru and Dr Ambedkar are deeply skeptical of Gandhian view on religion and politics.

Pt. Nehru believes in Minority Rights, Tolerance and scientific Modernization keeping role of religion minimal in Politics esp. Majority religion.

While Ambedkar believes in Constitutional Morality as overriding Religious/Traditional/Customary morality that often perpetuates casteism, Patriarchy etc.

Despite criticism Gandhi's views are possible solution for declining ethics in Politics (eg: Money-Muscle Power) and Religious Polarization in country.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

Que.3(a)

Define Value Pluralism. Critically examine Isaiah Berlin's views on positive and negative liberty? (20 Marks)

Isaiah Berlin in TWO CONCEPTS OF LIBERTY proposes the notion of Value Pluralism.

He asserts that values are 'inherently Pluralistic' i.e. not only they differ amongst different people but same values have different meanings for different people.

For instance value of Equality would mean Equality of Opportunity for liberals and Equality of outcomes for Marxists.

Further values are mutually incommensurable i.e. cannot be measured or quantified and hence there is no value-hierarchy.



Value-Pluralism is different from both:

A) Value-Monism (Supremacy of one value)

B) Value-Relativism (Indifference towards different values)

It denotes preference towards a particular value-system while exercising Tolerance toward other value-systems.

It also rejects Rawlsian hierarchy or 'lexical ordering' of values in Theory of Justice.

Isaiah Berlin extends his idea of Value-Pluralism to debates on liberty.

He argues there is lack of consensus on meaning of



Liberty that is foundation of Liberalism.

As Classical Liberals (Locke, JS Mill, Robert Nozick) define it as 'absence of coercion' i.e. Negative conception of Liberty. [Minimal State].

While Social Liberals (Rawls, TH Green, Dworkin) justify 'State Intervention' to deliver 'Positive Liberty' i.e. 'freedom from deprivation/needs'. [Welfare State].

However Berlin warns that 'Positive Liberty' in name of Development brings risk of Totalitarianism (eg: USSR, China)



Thus for him Negative Liberty that recognizes Value-Pluralism and exercises Tolerance forms substantive heart of Liberalism.

However CB Macpherson criticizes it as 'narrow' view that supports 'Bourgeois Capitalism' undermining ' Egalitarianism'.

while Bhikhu Parekh says Modern Welfare States all practice 'Positive Liberty' that balances 'individual freedom' with 'Public Good'

Yet Berlin's idea of Value Pluralism remains a solution to 'Clash of Civilizations' by promoting dialogue amongst Civilizations

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.3(b)

Analyse how the theory of materialistic interpretation of history provides the scientific account of the development of human societies. (15 Marks)

Hegel was first to study the movement of 'history' through Dialectical evolution of ideas

His disciple Karl Marx turned 'Hegelian Idealism' on its head to propose a materialistic interpretation of history.

In his magnum opus 'DAS KAPITAL', Marx attempted a scientific account of the development of human societies through his theory of 'Historical Materialism'.

He argued that 'Economic structure' forms the 'Basic Structure' while human society

and its nature is mere
Super Structure.

Production in economic terms is necessary for Survival and is a social act. Hence the purpose of society becomes 'Economic Production' and 'relations of production' is division of labour.

If mode of production is pre-agrarian it creates hunter-gatherer society, while agrarian structure creates Feudalistic ^{society} and Industrial mode creates Bourgeois Capitalistic society.

Thus he suggests a post-industrial in future will be a 'classless society' brought by Communist Proletarian Revolution.



Marx decried earlier interpretations as Ideological 'False consciousness' claiming his theory as Scientific.

However Max Weber criticized him 'Economic reductionism' while Karl Popper called him enemy of 'Open Society' for guilt of Historicism.

Thus Neo-Marxists like Gramsci augment Marxist mode of analysis to integrate role of cultural/ideological factors in shaping history.

Though it fails Scientific criteria of 'Falsification' (Popper) it serves as useful critique of Capitalism making it more humane.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.3(c)

Distinguish between formal equality and substantive equality.
Compare equality of resources with equality of capabilities. (15 Marks)

'Equality is a Sovereign Virtue'
- Ronald Dworkin

values in Political Science
are inherently Pluralistic
and Incommensurable as
Isaiah Berlin describes in his
concept of Value-Pluralism.

Thus there is a debate
on nature of Equality.

Formal Equality preferred
by Classical Liberals denotes
'Equality of Opportunity'. Thus

as scholars from Locke to Nozick
believe everyone is equal before
law i.e. Civil and Political Equality.

while Social Liberals (TH
Green, Rawls, Laski) go beyond

formal equality to create
substantive equality (Socio-economic Equality)

Rawls suggests 'Difference Principle' for 'Affirmative Action'

(Social Security, Welfare) in favour
of most marginalized.

While Dworkin using the
idea of 'Moral Luck' proposes
'Just Initial Distribution' or
initial 'equality of resources'
through an auction.

He argues once equality of
resources' is achieved we create
substantive equality that is any
future inequality is product of
free-will and mutual consent.

In contrast Amartya
Sen takes a Consequentialist



Outcome focussed approach to define substantive equality as 'equality of capabilities'.

He argues that when each Individual achieves his/her full potential by complete development of his capabilities then equality is achieved.

For instance in Indian scenario; Fundamental Rights denote Formal Equality (A-14), Directive Principles and Reservations denote Substantive Equality. While equal provision of public goods (food, housing) is Dworkin's idea while investment in Human Development is SEN's idea.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.5(a)

Discuss the features of Asymmetrical federalism in Indian constitution. (10 Marks)

KC Wheare describes Indian Federalism in contrast with American Symmetric Federalism as Asymmetrical.

Rajya Sabha (Upper House) unlike US Senate has Unequal representation proportional to Population. [eg: UP: 31 vs Sikkim: 1 seat].

while some states like erstwhile J&K (A370) and Nagaland (A 371) enjoy 'Special Constitutional status'.

Further 5th and 6th Schedule gives greater Financial and Administrative autonomy to Scheduled and tribal areas.

Fiscally the asymmetric-ness manifests in:

- a) North-South Divide in Devolution of funds by Finance Commission
- b) 'Special Category Status' to Hilly and North-Eastern states for Centrally Sponsored Schemes.

Thus Prof. Alfred Stepan describes Indian Federalism as 'demos-enabling' while US as 'demos-constraining'. And it is better suited for developing countries with Regional Diversity and Disparity to counter Centrifugal tendencies.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.5(b)

Elaborate the role of supreme court as a conscience keeper of Indian constitution. (10 Marks)

Pt. Nehru described Supreme Court (SC) as active participant of India's Social Transformation.

In initial years, SC exercised Judicial Restraint following the 'procedure established by law', (Shankari Prasad case).

With Golak Nath Case (1967) we see first signs of Judicial Activism in protecting Constitution and Constitutionalism by declaring Fundamental Rights (FRs) as sacrosanct.

When challenged by series of amendments that attempted to fundamentally change the constitution during the Dangerous Decade (Selig Harrison)



of 1970s; SC responded by Judicial Innovation of Basic Structure Doctrine in Kesavanand Bharti case. (1973).

Further with PIL Revolution it led to Progressive Realization of Rights. by expanding the scope of A-21 (Right to Life) (eg: Right to Healthy Environment: Mc Mehta case).

In Maneka case (1978) it accepted the 'due process' doctrine.

while in recent Sabrumala or Triple-Talag cases it upheld Constitutional Morality over Traditional/Customary Morality.

Thus SC has kept conscience of Constitution by evolving it to meet changing Socio-economic reality.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.5(c)

Write short note on Dalit perspective of Indian National Movement.
(10 Marks)

Sunil Khilnani in his book IDEA OF INDIA describes how different ideological perspectives constitute Indian National Movement (INM).

Dalit Perspective is influenced by Systemic Oppression under Brahmanical Orthodoxy.

Hence many Dalit leaders welcomed British Raj as 'liberating' and 'modernising' force shattering rigid caste hierarchies.

Jyotiba Phule claimed that 'British Raj' is better than exploitative 'Peshwa Raj'.

Similarly Dr. Ambedkar called for 'Annihilation of Caste'.



As without feeling of Fraternity the Congress idea of Nationalism is 'empty rhetoric'.

He also criticized Gandhiji for upholding 'varna-system' and not fasting (Satyagraha) for Dalit cause.

However modern subaltern historiographers like Sumit Sarkar agree that INC was dominated by 'Upper castes' but it also represented Dalits and Gandhiji took active steps for Dalit emancipation (eg: Harijan Sevak Sevha)

Thus as Bipin Chandra calls INM as truly 'Mass Movement' with primary contradiction as BRITISH and secondary contradictions like Caste got subsumed.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.5(d)

Highlight the role women in Freedom Struggle. (10 Marks)

Historian Bipin Chandra believes inclusion of women made our freedom struggle a true mass movement.

In Pre-Gandhian phase; Tarabai Shinde and Pt. Ramabai emerged as proto-feminists who raised women's issues (marriage, education).

Annie Beasant with Home Rule Movement and Presidentship of Congress (1916) illustrated the central role of women in freedom struggle.

During Gandhian Phase, Women became 'Moral Force' i.e. Sita against British Raavan Raj. They engaged in Picketing, promoting Swadeshi and busted the myth of 'Civilizing mission'



perpetuated by British to justify colonialism.

Sarojini Naidu wrote feminist poetry, walked side-by-side Gandhi during Dandi March and represented India Internationally.

The Revolutionary Activities too saw participation of brave women like Durga Bhabhi, Kalpana Dutta etc.

While women's role reached its zenith during Quit India Movement as Arun Asaf Ali led the Underground Movement and Usha Mehta operated Congress Radio while INA of Bose had separate Rani Laxmibai regiment.

Thus women's role in freedom struggle is source of inspiration for Feminist Movements today.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

(Please do not write anything except the question number in this space)

कृपया इस स्थान में प्रश्न संख्या के अतिरिक्त कुछ न लिखें।

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
Content of the Question is more important than length.

(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को इस हद्दिए में नहीं लिखना चाहिए
Candidates must not write on this margin

5(c) Indian Parliament due to Prismatic nature of Indian society has suffered 'Institutional Decay' (Huntington).
(Riggs)

The colonial legacy of Overdeveloped State (Hamza Alwi) and Judicial Overreach (Justice Katju) has led to decline of Parliament.

As V-DEM report shows there is risk of 'Electoral Autocracy' as debate and deliberation are undermined by disruptions, walk-outs, lower attendance and reduced working-hours of Parliament.

As Milan Vaishnav shows there is dominance of Money

(Please do not write anything except the question number in this space)

कृपया इस स्थान में प्रश्न संख्या को अतिरिक्त कुछ न लिखें।

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
Content of the Question is more important than length.

(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को इस हाशिए में नहीं लिखना चाहिए
Candidates must not write on this margin

and Muscle Power with over 40% MPs with Criminal Antecedents [PRS].

Parliamentary Committees are reduced to role of 'sideline spectators' with ZERO bills referred in 17th LS.

The Lynchpin of Parliament i.e. Speaker has become Politicized as seen in Aadhar as Money Bill or matters of Defection.

As Zoya Hasan argues due to lack of Intra-party Democracy and weak Opposition Parliamentary decline will continue.

Since Parliament is 'temple of Democracy' its sanctity and dignity needs to be restored for future of Indian Democracy.



Que.7(a)

Trace the trajectory of UCC debate in India. Do you think Uniform Civil Code is suitable for the country which pride itself on the Idea of "Unity in Diversity". (20 Marks)

Uniform Civil Code (UCC) is a constitutional Mandate for uniform set of Personal laws (marriage, inheritance etc) under A-44.

At the time of independence feminist like Rajkumari Amrit Kaur, Hansa Mehta and communists like KM Munshi supported UCC. They argued it will liberate women from customary/Religious Doctrines and bring true Secularism based on 'Universal Citizenship'.

But the traditionalists and conservatives like Pocker Sahib and Ismail Sahib opposed it.



Supreme Court (SC) in multiple judgements (Shah Bano, (1985), Sarala Mudgal, Daniel Latifi, Shayara Bano (2017) cases) has called for UCC.

It can prevent, as Arun Shourie, LK Advani, suggest, 'Minority Appeasement', protect Individual Rights, increase Fraternity and replace Indian 'pseudo-secularism' with western-style secularism.

But as its critics argue it goes against Indian Idea of 'Unity in Diversity' and Gandhian Secularism based on SARVA DHARMA SAMBHAVA

Further UCC violates Indian
Multiculturalism based on
'Differentiated Citizenship'
(Will Kymlicka).

Feminist lawyer Flavia
Agnes argue 'malafide motivation'
behind push for UCC can
further polarize and marginalize
Minorities esp. Muslims.

As a practical matter
Zoya Hasan points out
there is 'lack of consensus'
even within 'Shariat'
while 'Nivedita Menon'
warns of risks of further
Politicization and neglect of
broader issue of 'Gender'



Justice?

Thus Law Commission itself has found UCC at present to be 'neither necessary nor desirable'

Rather piecemeal reform led by SC based on 'Doctrine of Essentiality' as seen in Sabrimala and Triple Talag cases that ensures a balance b/w Individual (A-21) and Minority / Religious (A-25, 29, 30) Rights is the way forward.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.7(b)

Highlight the contours of the fight to privacy given by supreme court in Putta Swamy Case. What concerns emerge with respect to the future of India's democracy due to software's like Pegasus. (15 Marks)

Constitutional bench of Supreme Court (SC) in Putta Swamy case (2015) declared Right to Privacy as intrinsic part of 'life and personal liberty' under A-21.

It argued Protection of 'personal sphere' from both state and Society is pre-condition for individual dignity, freedom of speech and expression and is fundamental to human existence.

It clarified Privacy at its core includes preservation of personal intimacies, sanctity of family life, sexual orientation,



health records etc.

However it needs to be balanced with legitimate concerns of State like National Security, greater Public interest etc.

However the recent Pegasus scandal shows how software can facilitate 'Mass Surveillance' violating both Right to Privacy and Rule of Law.

Shoshana Zuboff warns of risks of age of either State Surveillance (eg: China) or Big Tech Surveillance (eg: USA).

undermining democracy.
It can be used to monitor and compromise Civil



Society, Opposition party members and critics of regime.

Thus by attacking criticism the Participatory and Deliberative aspects of Democracy are undermined.

And as V-DEM and Freedom House report warns there is risk of emergent 'electoral autocracy'.

Hence 'Right to Privacy' is central to future of Democracy and is considered part of 4th generation Digital Human Rights.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.7(c)

How caste census is linked to Politics of distributive Justice in India. What are the various dimensions of debates within India's reservation policy. (15 Marks)

Distributive Justice is concerned with fair and equitable distribution of material resources as per Directives (A-38 and 39) in Indian Constitution.

India's Reservation policy based on caste is an attempt to correct historical injustices to achieve distributive Social Justice in present.

However as Justice Rohini Commission showed within caste most benefits accrue to top-layer. Hence demand for caste-census. It will help better understand socio-economic reality



of India, and design evidence-based policy that creates intra-caste equity.

Further with already available SECC, NSSO, NFHS data it is easily implementable.

However critics argue it can Re-Mandalization of Indian Politics. It can also spark further demand from groups like Jats, Gujjars etc for Preferential reservation.

On implementation side it becomes unfeasible due to complex jati-wise breakup (eg: Yadav vs Yadhavans)

The Reservation debate in India as Ramchandra Guha asserts generates more heat



than light?

Yogendra Yadav prefers Reservation as it has led to Democratic Upsurge and provided representation to Dalits but there remains serious lacunas in implementation.

However Pratap Bhanu Mehta argues against reservation as it leads to hypocritical Dual Morality, promotes zero-sum thinking and reduces Dalit self-esteem.

Thus Reservation is NOT a panacea; rather positive sum Inclusive Growth (Sabka Saath Sabka Vikas) should be the way forward.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	