



Political Science & International Relations

Crash Course & Test Series - 2020

Test 05

Time Allowed: 3 Hours

Max Marks: 250

Name VAIBHAV RAWAT
Test Date 13/12/2020
Email Address _____
Mobile _____
UPSC Roll No 7100243

Instructions:

1. There are EIGHT questions divided in TWO SECTIONS and candidate has to attempt five questions in all.
2. Question Nos. 1 and 5 are compulsory and out of the remaining, any three are to be attempted choosing at least ONE question from each section.
3. Content of the answer is more important than its length.
4. Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of the booklet in the space provided.
5. Content of the answer is more important than its length.
6. Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
7. All parts of the question should be written at one place itself.
8. Write the test in exam atmosphere.
9. **Filling all the details in BLOCK LETTERS is mandatory.**

S. No.	a	b	c	d	e	Total
1						
2				X	X	
3				X	X	
4				X	X	
5						
6				X	X	
7				X	X	
8				X	X	
Grand Total						

Que.1(a)

Section-A

Hobbes' Theory of Political obligation.

(10 Marks)

Political obligation refers to duty a citizen / subject owes towards the state. Issues of political obligation like how far should one obey the state have been a centre piece of normative political philosophy.

Thomas Hobbes developed the first social contract theory in his book 'The Leviathan'. Having seen the fallout of Puritan Revolution of 1649 and the anarchy in Britain, he gave an unlimited theory of political obligation.

Hobbes held that the state is Sovereign in complete sense and man has no liberty (liberty is where law is

silent). According to Hobbes security of life precedes any other liberty/right.

Although he is an individualist and materialist in assumption, he ends up being an absolutist (C.B. Macpherson).

Hobbes held that human nature is selfish and in the state of nature, there was no right except might.

Thus, ~~to~~ even today Hobbes concept of sovereignty is the basis of modern nation states. Karl Marx himself called "Hobbes as father of all 'of us'".

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

Que.1(b)

Deliberative Democracy**(10 Marks.)**

Lord Bryce defined Democracy as rule by the people, where majority forms the legislation and is governed by the general will.

Although the term deliberative democracy is redundant since deliberation is the only way the general will could be filtered (Rousseau). But since representative democracy is the practicable form of democracy, the idea of deliberative democracy has come up.

Toshua Cohen has given 5 elements of a deliberative democracy :



- an independent and ongoing association of people.
- a non-coercive environment
- deliberation forming policy
- Discussions and debates preferred over voting choices
- Deliberation serves as the source of legitimacy.

As Habermas has given, ideal speech condition and communicative action is required to achieve deliberate democracy

According to Amartya Sen, 'public reasoning' is essential in a democracy. Public Health gets neglected as it is not part of public discourse. Hence media is vital in deliberative demo.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.1(c)

Saptanga Theory of Kautilya.

(10 Marks).

Kautilya is considered the greatest statesman in ancient India. In his book 'Arthashastra' he has given his theory of Saptanga - the seven organs of any state.

Each state has these seven units :

- 1) A King (~~Amatya~~)
- 2) A Treasury (Kosh)
- 3) Ministers (Amatya)
- 4) Land & people
- 5) Fort (Durg)
- 6) Armed Force / Police (Danda)
- 7) Spies

Kautilya gave advice to 'Vijigishu' that foreign policy decisions should be based on calculations of comparative

strength of the enemy's Saptanga.

Thus, choosing the four fold
(Sam, Dam, Dand, Bhed)
options or the six choices (Shadgunya

Siddhant) depends upon $12 * 7 = 84$

measurements. 12 are states of

Mandal Siddhant.

Even today we see geopolitical
theorist Rudolf Kjellen has given several
elements of state which are inspired from
Kautilya's Saptanga Theory. Thus Kautilya
is regarded as India's greatest strategic
thinker.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.1(d)

Aristotle's Theory of citizenship.

(10 Marks).

Aristotle is considered as the greatest intellectual among all political philosophers (Barnes). His Theory of citizenship is a result of his search for the ideal ^{state} yet practical.

In his book 'Politics', Aristotle held that citizenship should not only be based on procedural aspects of Jus sanguine or Jus soli. He held that active participation (substantive aspect of citizenship) should be the criteria. Thus educated men fulfilled his criteria. Feminists scholars criticize Aristotle for leaving out women, and slaves.

Que.1(e)

~~Marxist perspective of politics as class struggle.~~

for matters of 'polis'.

~~(10 Marks)~~

Aristotle's concern for 'polis' being more important than 'oikos' is reflected later in Hannah Arendt's concept of human condition. Only when citizens take part in public life in concert with each other, they exercise real freedom.

Hence Aristotle's idea of citizenship although not applicable in current times due to its exclusionary nature yet inspires civic engagement.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

1 (2) Marxist perspective of politics as class struggle.

Karl Marx developed his theory of Historical Materialism in his book 'Das Kapital' and inspired the working class for a revolution in 'Communist Manifesto'.

According to Marxists, the idea of historical materialism is a scientific explanation. "All Hitherto history, is a history of class struggle". Material inequality of "haves" and "have nots" define all social order. Thus Marx held that economic structure of the society is its basic structure.

For Marx politics is a class struggle defined by irreconcilable interests.

of two antagonistic classes - the capitalists and the proletariat in the 19th century Britain. Thus working class should overthrow the Bourgeois state.

However later Marxists like Althusser has called it Marx's reductionism.

He gave multistructural analysis. Gramsci held that class struggle is perpetuated through cultural hegemony.

Liberal scholar Max Weber (Protestant Ethic and rise of Capitalism) held that Marx ignored rise of managerial class due to capitalism.

Although ever rising inequality (Thomas Piketty) makes Marxist perspective a relevant political analysis even today.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.2(a)

What are the differences between participatory and representative democracy? Do you think participatory democracy is possible in contemporary world?

(20 Marks).

Democracy has been an ancient political phenomena both in east and the west. Although classical democracy analysts viewed it only as a form of government but it is also a way of life.

A. Lincoln described democracy as rule 'for the people, by the people, of the people'.

However as James Bryce has shown it is only rule by the people that is important for

political theory analysis. Early exponents of democracy like Hobbes, J. Locke & Rousseau gave 'Social Contract' among people as the legitimacy of democratic government (The General Will).

But due to practical difficulties of large states, direct democracy seemed infeasible. Hence representative democracy is the most accepted form today (J.S. Mill).

In a representative form of democracy, chosen representatives decide legislation. Whereas in a participatory democracy, the general will is filtered through people's participation/ consent (Rousseau).

Representative form of democracy lacks the substantive aspect of educating its citizens, increased engagement of the people in the rule by self (democracy).
As Habermas and A-Sen has given participat

democracy is vital for making democracies responsible and accountable in contemporary world.

scholars like Jacques Rancier held that participative democracy is the only way to deal with problems of corruption and social exclusion. Plato's hatred for democracy and J.S. Mill's reluctance towards democracy in developing world has the same solution.

Representative democracies turn into a game of numbers and majoritarian tyranny. Given the increasing multi-ethnic societies both in the west and the 3rd world, ensuring citizen engagement is necessary to stop totalitarian trends (Hannah Arendt's)



However feminists claim that a single public space can't be inclusive for all. Hence 'counter-public space' that promotes views of minority is necessary.

As Albert Camus said that democracy is not about rule of majority but protection of minority.

Indian government has also tried to bring participatory democracy through 73rd & 74th Constitutional amendments. Initiatives like RTI, Citizen Charter, Social Audit, Gram Sabha can help India turn a participatory democracy.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.2(b)

"State is an individual writ large." In light of the above statement, critically examine Plato's theory of justice

(15 Marks).

Plato is considered as father of political philosophy for his search for an ideal state. In his book 'The Republic' Plato gave his theory of Justice based on god's own conception of justice as seen in each individual.

For Plato state does not appear out of oak or rock but is present in the minds of its citizens. Hence the rule of reason / logic that is applicable on individuals also hold for the state. Hence he held that state is an individual writ large.

The idea behind Plato's theory of Justice is inspired from Socrates' theory



of knowledge and Pythagoras' theory of soul. Each person has a soul made up of three distinct elements - reason, courage and appetite.

A just soul is the one where reason dominates. When there is a functional specialisation for each element, there is harmony. Hence he prescribes that in state as well philosophers should be the rulers and there should be a clear division of roles as per each individual's merit. His theory of education, communism of property and family all are logical extensions of his theory on justice.



However extreme society is an unjust society (Aristotle). In trying to achieve the ideal state Plato has sacrificed the best possible. Aristotle has refined Plato's ideas and gave concept of proportional equality as the basis of just society.

Although Plato's conception of remediation of corrupt society and promotion of ethics in politics was right yet his idea of justice falls short. As given by Rawls justice as fairness is the most acceptable form of justice.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.2(c)

Compare the distinctive features of Hindu tradition with the Buddhist tradition of Indian Political thought

(15 Marks).

Max Mueller has held that no where in the world has ~~man~~^{human mind} dealt with the issues of ~~mind~~^{life} as much in India. Hindu political thought and Buddhist political thought are two major streams found in India.

Although the concepts of Dharma or 'Dhamma' (in Buddhism), Danda are common to both yet as Bhikkhupauk held Buddhism is a rebel child of Hinduism, hence has developed new ideas.

Hindu political thought is based on 'Manusmriti' to eliminate 'Asajakta'



or anarchy, a code of conduct was prescribed. The ideals of Rajdharma for King; Purushartha for common folk and Varnashrama system for social order are major features.

In Buddhism, the purpose is to alleviate 'Dukkha' or suffering, hence ideals of 3 jewels of Buddhism: Buddha, Dhamma, Sangha are preached. Buddhism follows Anicca: law of impermanence & Anatta: selflessness. Hence it is held that Buddhism has no political thought as it is an other worldly religion.

However Jai Prakash Narayan holds that Buddha was a political philosopher as

seen in ideals of Ashoka. Ashoka's emphasis on winning hearts & soul instead of land through 'Dhamma Chakra' stands opposed to Hindu 'Chakravarti Samrat'.

Manusmriti was exclusionary in nature as it gave different penalties for lower castes and women whereas Buddhism was based on 'human dignity and no discrimination' (B.R. Ambedkar).

Thus both Hindu and Buddhist tradition holds lessons for political theory and it would be a loss to western scholars to ignore it (Alasdair MacIntyre).

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Section-B

Que.5(a)

Judicial Activism.

(10 Marks).

Indian Constitution envisaged a fiercely independent and an active judiciary to achieve the goal of social revolution (Granville Austin).

Indian judiciary is the protector of constitution, guardian of fundamental rights, preserver of federalism and also administers the institution of justice.

But it is sometimes criticized for ignoring its duties and interfere in other organs of the state.

Pratap Bhanu Mehta holds Indian Judicial Activism comes at the cost of negligence of its basic duties. With a

pendancy of 3.4 Million cases as per Economic Survey. A case clearance rate of less than 100% and a undertrial percentage of 50% in prisons. Indian Judicial Activism seems inappropriate.

However as Zia Mody (10 Judgements that changed India) held Judicial Activism in cases like K. Bharti for doctrine of Basic structure has helped India survive as a democracy.

Recent judgements for gender equality and individual rights (privacy - Puttaswamy case) is aligned with the goal of transformative Constitution.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.5(b)

Basic Structure Doctrine.

(10 Marks).

(Supreme Court)
Indian Judiciary has made itself the strongest court in the world with the pronouncement of doctrine of Basic structure.

It is a judicial review doctrine on constitutional amendments. No other court in the world reviews the Constitution itself. However owing to historical contexts of Executive Overreach, Supreme Court in K. Bharti case struck down 25th Constitutional Amendment changes made to Article 368 and Article 13 (Amendment) (Judicial Review)
~~supreme court has not given any~~
~~exhaustive list~~



Supreme court held that Parliament can amend any provision of the constitution except its Basic structure.

However basic structure has not been defined. Pratap Bhanu Mehta calls this

'Judicial Supremacy'. However Supreme

Court held that there has to be a

difference in Parliament and Constituent Assembly; Parliament enjoys only political popular

sovereignty whereas Constituent Assembly

had popular sovereignty.

Thus India is case of 'Judicial
Co-governance' (Bhikhu Parekh)

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

Que.5(c)

74th Amendment Act**(10 Marks).**

Indian Parliament enacted 74th Amendment to introduce Municipal Bodies as the third tier (urban governance) in Indian political system.

Article 243P to Article 243ZT and 12th schedule of the Constitution deals with these. Due to Neo-liberal policy adopted and under IMF's 'Structural Adjustment Programme' India introduced good governance mechanisms.

Today cities occupy just 2% of the land but contribute 70% to the GDP and hence their administration is crucial to India's economic growth (NITI Aayog). But several problems

in the law plague the cities administration

74th amendment act itself was based on compromise. The state governments themselves being 'glorified municipalities' have not devolved funds, functions and functionaries to the ULBs. Since in the law only skeleton was provided, it is upto the political will of state leaders to ensure success of 74th amendment.

As A. Sen held that unless public demands get converted into electoral demands the issue remains neglected. Urban governance has been a supply side initiative and that too half heartedly due to dominance of rural constituencies in Parliament

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.5(d)

Article 32.

(10 Marks).

Article 32 provides for the enforcement of fundamental rights in part III of the constitution. Any citizen can seek justice from Supreme Court for violation of FRs thus making India a liberal democracy with written 'social contract'.

B.R. Ambedkar held that Article 32 is the soul of the constitution. Hence Supreme Court has been an active proponent of the fundamental rights. SC issues various writs like Habeas Corpus, Mandamus, Certiorari, Quo Warranto and Prohibition under Article 32.

However ~~such~~ due to contrary

provisions and underlying philosophy (liberalism - part III and socialism - part IV) several disputes arose between Judiciary and Executive. Starting from ~~the~~ C. Doraiga case till Minerva Mills 1980 case Judiciary had changed several stance regarding Article 32's implications.

However now it is settled that Article 39 (b) and (c) can abridge any FR (doctrine of Harmonious Construction). Supreme Court apart from Hebrews Corpus case (ADM Jabalpur) and Emergency has been able to do justice to the spirit of Article 32 as protector of citizen rights.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

Que.5(e)

Unorganized labour in India.**(10 Marks).**

Indian state has undergone fundamental change in its political economy in 1991. With the adoption of neoliberal model of development, there has been a vast increase in unorganized labour in the country.

~~Since~~ labour issues have remained sidelined even during pre-independence (Jumtā Sarkar). Post independence trade unions became junior partners of the political parties. With increasing migration and footloose workforce, unorganized agricultural labours, construction workers and domestic helpers have become devoid of political patronage.



Thus the state needs to extend social security benefits to the unorganized labour to ensure the goal of constitution of providing a life of dignity to all.

The issues of feminization of poverty and feminization of agriculture, the caste discrimination prolonging manual scavenging practices have been dealt by the state without full success. Code on Social Security 2020 and formalization of workforce are needed going forward.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.6(a)

Agricultural reforms in India have been influenced by the philosophy of capitalism. What will be the impact of the recent agricultural reforms on small and marginal farmers in India?

(20 Marks).

India is a predominantly agricultural country even in 2020 with more than 50% population engaged in the sector (census 2011). However GDP contribution of 16% shows that there is serious distress in agriculture in India.

India in 1960s underwent food shortage problem which led to the first reform in the sector. Green Revolution was driven by capitalism in its needs to increase the yields, higher productivity through use of HYV seeds, irrigation and chemicals. This led to India becoming a surplus state with food exports to

several LDCs and even China :

The philosophy of capitalism was although applied in a distorted way.

India of 1960s was a socialist country and measures of price controls, permit raj and Mandi system ^(in agriculture) were prevalent.

The effects of this led to the decline in farmer's share due to imperfect market and several intermediaries <sub>↓
parasitic</sub>.

LDC reforms based on neoliberal capitalism (Washington Consensus) were not introduced in the farming sector which led to farmers becoming overly dependent on state. Profit ~~was~~ ^{is} not the goal of farming even today in India.

However as Dr. G.S. Bhalla held that green revolution did bring 4x increase in income of farmers, there is a need to introduce free markets in the sector and liberalise the caged Indian farmers.

The recent farm laws brought by the government bring 3 changes:

- (1) Introduce & regulate contract farming
- (2) Ensuring private markets, thus One Nation one Market system outside the Mandis
- (3) Amending Essential Commodities Act to ensure development of private infrastructure in the sector.

India has 86% small and marginal farmers that lock large savings due to smaller profits. They can't invest in technology upgradation, better seeds



or the much needed diversification of agriculture produce.

Since cereals dominate India's farms, high profit giving alternatives like horticultural crops, fishing, dairy would be promoted that can increase profits for small and marginal farmers.

Increased bargaining power through FPOs and farmer favouring Contract Act can help in making India's farmers 'Atma Nirbhar'. Thus rightly said, these 3 reforms could be the 1991 moment for agriculture in India.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.6(b)

Discuss the different stages of federal re-organisation of states in India. How far has it satisfied the regional aspirations in India?

(15 Marks).

India is considered as a sui-generis model of federalism (Granville Austin). Due to historical factors of partition and cessionist trends among diverse regions India adopted for cooperative model of federalism with a strong centre.

Article 3 deals with reorganisation of states in India. As held by Louis Tullin (Remapping India) India still does not have strict internal boundaries. She has explained federal reorganisation in three different stages:

1) Since 1950 - 1956 States Reorganisation Act that led to change in peninsular India on linguistic lines. Even Gandhi



held that British division was unnatural and some homogenisation is helpful for administration.

2) 1970s and 80s : change in Hindi heartland based on linguistic, ^{religion} ~~caste~~ and ethnic lines (North East).

3) Since 21st century, Division of Chattisgarh, Uttarakhand and Jharkhand based on good governance and development.

However Christophe Jaffrelot argues it was based on political calculations. For example SRC held Telangana

to be separate but Nehru feared Congress breakdown and Communist dominance hence rejected the idea.

Regional aspirations of people based on ethnic / identity lines have been



met through 'asymmetrical federalism'.

For example Article 371A gives special provisions for Nagaland.

However rising developmental imbalance ^(UP) in the regions, misuse of Article 356 by Centre in Kashmir, ethnic clashes and language imposition in North East are still raising issues of autonomy and even secession (Nagelism).

As Sarkaria Commission held that such demands are not only due to cultural scarcity but also call for development hence through Schedule 5, 6 and 73rd & 74th amendment, need to bring good governance.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.6(c)

Examine the role and participation of Indian women in the Indian National Movement.

(15 Marks).

Nationalist literature showcases Indian National Movement as a mass struggle led by INC but now there has been an increasing focus on contribution of women in the movement.

Several Indian women royalties defended their states from British conquest as opposed to their male counterparts. Rani Lakshmi Bai of Kittor and Queen of Andore are some examples.

It was M. Gandhi who could skillfully use women strength in Satyagrah. Several women like Sarojini Naidu, Amrit Kaur, Sucheta Kriplani, Usha Mehta



Vijayalakshmi Pandit led INC's struggle

Many women contributed in the socialist and Irish-Nihilist inspired revolutionary terrorism. Bina Das shot the governor of Assam. Kalpava Dutta and Priti lata Waddadar are other examples.

Not just political struggle several women contributed in raising mass awareness through social reform. Durgabai Deshmukh, Savitribai Phule, Pandita Ramabai, Begum ^{Rokeya Hussain} Hazrat are few examples.

In India's first war of independence Rani Laxmi Bai and Begum Hazrat of Lucknow fought British valiantly in 1857. They inspired INA to have a special women regiment led by Rani Laxmi Sehgal.



As per Sumit Sankar, Indian National Congress never had issues of women in focus rather they used women as tools for national struggle. This got reflected in opposition to Hindu Code Bill drafted by A.B.R. Ambedkar by stalwarts like Rajendra Prasad.

Thus Indian women have made widespread contribution which has not been studied ~~in~~ historiographically.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

Que.7(a)

What features set Indian elections apart? What have been the main shifts and patterns in Indian elections in last two decades?

(20 Marks).

India is known for two things - Taj Mahal and Indian elections as per former CEC S.Y. Qureshi. India is the world's largest democracy and the most successful one in the third world.

Mukulika Banerjee ~~Zoya Maslam~~ has analyzed features of Indian elections. The biggest puzzle is why Indians vote? Some people vote due to power inversion. They need to hold representatives accountable. Some people vote due to caste and identity allegiances. Indian middle class votes to uphold their duty. Some voters vote to appreciate the efforts of Election



Commission.

Christophe Joffe argues that 'Indians don't cast their vote but vote their caste.' India's electoral politics is largely based on identity grounds of caste, religion and ethnicity (James Manor).

Rudolph & Rudolph term Indian elections as 'modernisation of traditions' and 'traditionalization of modernity'. Despite being a democratic modern exercise based on rational bureaucratic lines; Indian elections lack features of ~~modern~~ mature democracy. lack of intra party democracy, use of money & muscle power have led to decline of Parliament.

Yogendra Yadav call this 'democratic upsurge' as natural. Thus plebianisation and criminalisation are marked features of India's elections (Milan Vaishnav).

In les two decades Indian politics has seen a shift from fragmentation and regionalization of issues to a more centralised nationalist discourse. Suhes Palshikar relate this to evolution of 'BJP system'.

Due to LPG policy of 1991 Indian elections has seen increased role of money thus criminalisation of politics has risen to 43% of 17th LS strength. (ADR data)



Yogendra Yadav calls Indian elections to have increased in width but lacking in depth. With higher social media coverage and emergence of Political Consultancies, Indian elections have also become an individual ^{focused} event rather than social ^{& nation building} event of the past.

As highlighted by Milon Vaishnav in his book "Battle Half Won" Indian democracy has performed well in elections but now there is a need to deepen democracy outside it. Even within elections, need to bring reforms as highlighted by 2nd ARC.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	



Que.7(b)

Critically examine the role of governors in India's federal politics

(15 Marks).

Barkaria Commission mentioned "governor as the lynchpin of India's federalism". It not only acts as the Constitutional head of the state government but also as vital communicative link with the centre to bring national perspective.

Article 153 provides for governor for each state and Article 154 vests all executive authority within the office of governor. Although Constitution gives, ~~the~~ governor to act in aid and advice of the Council of Ministers at the state level with the exception of

discretion allowed.

However the problem arises as the Constitution leaves it to the governor to decide what matter is to be decided by discretion in case of any dispute. Thus Supreme Court in

Shamsher Singh case held that governor is

not an agent of the Centre; since party calculations have dominated their acts in reality.

~~However~~ Paul Brass mentions that

governor has acted as 'Eyes and Ears' of the Centre. As seen in cases like

Nebam Rabia case of Arunchal Pradesh

the role of governor has become controversial; undermining the parliamentary any form of democracy at state level



Thus Jayantam Bhatia even advises to abolish the post itself. However as ~~held~~ held by ~~steps~~ B-R Ambedkar working of the constitution depends on the persons who govern the country. Hence there is a need to reform the office.

As Supreme Court in B.P. Singhel case held that removal should not be arbitrary. Appointment of the post should be based on consultation with CM (Sarkaria Commission). Above all governors should use their discretion as per constitutional morality and in the spirit of democracy.
(Manmohan Singh - Governors Conference)

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	

Que.7(c)

"The status of India as a nation is fatally flawed owing to the divisions of religion, Caste and ethnicity". Comment.

(15 Marks).

Imperial historians called India as not a nation rather a geographic construct. Due to lack of single overarching cohesive factor as seen in western nations ; India is considered a political nation.

India lacks 'fraternity' in the sense used in French Revolution (B.R. Ambedkar). The divisions of caste, religion and ethnicity has led to many western scholars like Selig Harrison calling India as a failed experiment.

However despite the dangerous decade of 1960s, religious riots, civic



unrest, linguistic reorganization demands
opposition to imposition of Hindi and
demands for tribal autonomy in North
East India has successfully remained
the world's largest democracy.

Despite wide diversity as explained
by John Rawls (Political Liberalism 1993)
India has an overlapping consensus that
allows for ^{different} comprehensive ~~differe~~ doctrines
to coexist. Prof. SD Muni explains this as
multi layered identity of each Indian.

Since no particular identity of
Caste, religion, ethnicity dominates hence
there is always a room for reconcilia-
tion of interests. This is aided by



multi cultural constitution (Pratap Bhanu Mehta) BR Ambedkar held that political democracy would be meaningless without social & economic democracy which has led ~~to~~ formation of fraternity among divided Indians of British Raj.

As held by Aurobindo Ghosh India had always been a nation ^{its} only spirit was dormant. However even today nation building initiatives like Ek Bharat Shiksha Bharat one sun to cultivate brotherhood and patriotism. Indian nationalism lies in its spirit of Unity in Diversity which is unique in the world.

Understanding of Questions	
Structure and Flow	
Subject Knowledge	
Presentation	
Overall Remarks :	